

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF APPEAL OF
SOUTH AFRICA**

**IN DIE HOOGSTE HOF VAN APPÈL VAN
SUID-AFRIKA**



FINAL ROLL

FEB - MAR 2025

20 January 2025

The number of the Judge to whom in each case the judgment
has been allocated is designated by dark shading

FEB - MAR 2025

1. Zondi AP
2. Mokgohloa ADP
3. Mocumie JA
4. Schippers JA
5. Nicholls JA
6. Mbatha JA
7. Hughes JA
8. Meyer JA
9. Matojane JA
10. Weiner JA
11. Kgoele JA
12. Kathree-Setiloane JA
13. Smith JA
14. Keightley JA
15. Unterhalter JA
16. Koen JA
17. Baartman JA
18. Coppin JA
19. Musi AJA
20. Phatshoane AJA
21. Vally AJA
22. Windell AJA
23. Bloem AJA
24. Modiba AJA
25. Molitsoane AJA
26. Norman AJA

Monday: 17 February 2025

COURT A

1. Dominique Camilla Manelis v Constantinos Charles Manelis

1235/2022 (GJ)

Zondi AP
Keightley JA
Coppin JA
Phatshoane AJA
Bloem AJA

COURT B

2. Siphosethu Ntakana obo Olumiyo Ntakana v Member of the Executive Council for Health: Eastern Cape

277/2023 (EMC)

Mokgohloa ADP
Weiner JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT C

3. Tashreeka Oliver N O v The MEC for Health, Western Cape Provincial Department of Health

886/2023 (WCC)

Mocumie JA
Unterhalter JA
Kgoele JA
Smith JA
Musi AJA

Tuesday: 18 February 2025

COURT A

4. Kristine Kalmer v Gaironisa Davids N O (in her capacity as the executor in the estate: late Yasmin Salie) and Western Province Athletics

501/2023 (WC)

Schippers JA
Meyer JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

COURT B

5. Lomastep (Pty) Ltd v Carlos Alberto Pereira Galego, Manuel Antonio Da Fonseca Vasconcelos Da Mota, Nuno Miguel De Sousa Alexandre, Carlos Alberto Grilo Pascoal, Tembalikayise John Lupepe, Mhansi Malaba, Carmen Khethiwe Nondumiso McClain, Noloyiso Lulama Mhlongo and Pedro Miguel Pereira Goncalves

896/2023 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Matojane JA
Baartman JA
Windell AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT C

6. Dr Waa Gouws (Johannesburg) (Pty) Ltd v HR Computek (Pty) Ltd, Yolandi Ann Mes, Johannes Hendrick Du Plessis N O, Marian Oelofsen N O, Welcome Norman N O and Master of the High Court, Johannesburg

909/2023 (GP)

Mbatha JA
Hughes JA
Kgoele JA
Unterhalter JA
Molitsokane AJA

Wednesday: 19 February 2025

COURT A

7. Saamwerk Soutwerke (Pty) Ltd and SA Soutwerke (Pty) Ltd

782/2023 (NCK)

Mokgohloa ADP
Kgoele JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA

Baartman JA
Musi AJA

COURT B

8. Endangered Wildlife Trust, Federation for a Sustainable Environment v Director-General (Acting) Department of Water and Sanitation, Atha-Africa Ventures (Pty) Ltd

1165/2023 (GP)

Schippers JA
Hughes JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA

COURT C

9. Haralambos Prokas N O, Fotini Prokas NO, Prinia Investment Capital (Pty) Ltd v Zoviflo (Pty) Ltd

61/2024 (GJ)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Koen JA
Bloem AJA
Modiba AJA

Thursday: 20 February 2025

COURT A

10. Pick 'n Pay Retailers (Pty) Ltd v Ramalho George Da Silva N O and Vilakazi Amanda Lindokuhle N O

946/2023 (GJ)

Zondi AP
Unterhalter JA
Coppin JA
Phatshoane AJA
Bloem AJA

COURT B

11. Isaac Tebogo Dithakanyane v The State

775/2023 (GJ)

Mocumie JA
Nicholls JA

Baartman JA
Musi AJA
Windell AJA

COURT C

Friday: 21 February 2025

COURT A

**12. Dirk Cornelis Uys N O, Carl Alexander Greatorex N O, Hester Sophia Uys N O v
National Credit Regulator and National Consumer Tribunal**

869/2023 (GP)

Mokgohloa ADP
Weiner JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Musi AJA
Windell AJA

COURT B

**13. George Local Municipality and Cape Estate Properties (Pty) Ltd (Formerly Magnolia
Ridge Properties 77 (Pty) Ltd, The Appeal Authorities, George Local Municipality,
Deputy Director Planning and Senior Manager: Land use management**

880/2023 (WCC)

Mocumie JA
Keightley JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA
Molitswane AJA

COURT C

14. The South African Legal Practice Council v Johann Oosthuizen

1258/2023 (FB)

Schippers JA
Nicholls JA
Mbatha JA
Unterhalter JA

Coppin JA

Monday: 24 February 2025

COURT A

15. Newnet (Pty) Ltd t/a Sunshine Hospital, The parties cited in Annexure 'A' to the Notice of Motion in the Main application and The Road Accident Fund

1150/2023 (GP)

Mocumie JA
Nicholls JA
Smith JA
Musi AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

16. Resilent Rock (Pty) Ltd v Voltex (Pty) Ltd t/a Atlas Group

1132/2023 (GJ)

Mbatha JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Baartman JA
Vally AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT C

17. Yossi Barel v Popular Trading CC, The Minister of Police, Shaun Hutcheon Carslow N O, Captain L W Tancrel, N O

1102/2023 (KZD)

Hughes JA
Kgoele JA
Unterhalter JA
Coppin JA
Bloem AJA

Tuesday: 25 February 2025

COURT A

**18. Sumeil (Pty) Ltd v Coogal Finance(Pty) Ltd (In Liquidation), Karen Fortein N O
and The Master of the Free State High Court, Bloemfontein**

1140/2023 (FB)

Zondi AP
Koen JA
Coppin JA
Phatshoane JA
Bloem AJA

COURT B

**19. Lebashe Investment Group (Pty) Ltd, Harth General Parties (Pty) Ltd, Harth Fund
Managers (Pty) Ltd, Warren Gregory Wheatley, Tshepo Duan Mahloele, Philip Jabulatin
Moleketi v United Democratic Movement, Bantubonke Harrington Holomisa**

1308/2023 (GJ)

Schippers JA
Hughes JA
Baartman JA
Windell AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C

**20. Aventino Ecotroopers Joint Venture, All Afrika Group (Pty) Ltd Ecotroopers
Construction (Pty) Ltd v The MEC for the Department of Roads and Transport, Gauteng
Province, Vea Road Maintenance and Civils (Pty) Ltd and Lubocon Civils CC**

1233/2023 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Mbatha JA
Unterhalter JA
Musi AJA
Molitswane AJA

Wednesday: 26 February 2025

COURT A

**21. The Loan Company (Pty) Ltd v The National Credit Regulator and The National
Consumer Tribunal**

1104/23 (GP)

Mokgohloa ADP
Keightley JA

Coppin JA
Phatshoane AJA
Vally AJA

COURT B

22. Johannes Frederick Gouws N O, Lynette Gouws N O, Willem Jacques Gouws N O, George Raymond Sloane N O v Johannes Petrus Erasmus Swarts N O, Johannes Petrus Erasmus Swarts N O, Anette Van Zyl N O, JDJ Holdings (Pty) Ltd, Evening Shade Properties 46 (Pty) Ltd

1250/2023 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Mbatha JA
Hughes JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Modiba AJA

COURT C

23. Lebogang Medupe, Sello Molefe, Itumeleng Moswane v African National Congress, Nono Maloyi, Luzzy Mokgosi, Louis Diremelo, Viola Motsumi, Sello Lehari, Suzan Dant Jie ,Motlalepula Rosho, Wendy Nelson, Kenetswe Mosenogi, Betty Kegakilwe, Tebogo Modise, Saliva Molapisi, Stella Mondlana, Siphon Dial, Mpho Khunou, Grace Moipolai, Hendrick Botha, Jostina Mkhize, Elizabeth Mokuia, Tebogo Motase, Nkotsoe Nketu, Victoria Makhaula, Nomvul Yiselo Sompia, Desso Mohono, Perlitia Chwene, Maria Monnana, Nthabiseng Shuping, Lenah Miga, Morutse Molefe, Tumelo Marupong, George Manyike Boipelo Mareko, Grace Masilo, Ceaser Mogatusi and Priscilla Williams

003/2024 (NW)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Kgoele JA
Smith JA
Bloem AJA

Thursday: 27 February 2025

COURT A

24. Aveng Mining Shafts & Underground v The Commissioner for The South African Revenue Service

1192/2023 (LP)

Zondi AP
Keightley JA
Koen JA
Coppin JA
Bloem AJA

COURT B

25. Doorware CC v Mercury Fittings CC

836/2023 (GJ)

Mokgohloa ADP
Schippers JA
Weiner JA
Modiba AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C

26. Set Square Developments (Pty) Ltd v Power Guarantees (Pry) Ltd and Vahva Construction (Pty) Ltd

099/2023 &150/2024 (GP)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Unterhalter JA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

Friday: 28 February 2025

COURT A

27. Selective Empowerment Investments 1 Ltd v Companies and Intellectual Property Commission

1325/2023 (GP)

Mokgohloa ADP
Mocumie JA
Unterhalter JA
Koen JA
Norman AJA

COURT B

28. The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service v Virgin Mobile South Africa (Pty) Ltd

1303/2023 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Keightley JA
Musi AJA
Windell AJA
Molitswane AJA

COURT C

Monday: 03 March 2025

COURT A

29. Tarentaal Centre Investment (Pty) Ltd and The Village Mall Investment (Pty) Ltd v Beneficio Developments (Pty) Ltd (Registration Number:2009/007912/07)

015/24 (GP)

Mokgohloa ADP
Hughes JA
Smith JA
Koen JA
Musi AJA

COURT B

30. Gianmarco Lorenzi v The State

1171/23 (WCC)

Mocumie JA
Kgoele JA
Coppin JA

COURT C

31. Industrial Development Corporation of South Africa Limited and African Development Bank v Kalagadi Manganese (Pty) Ltd, Kalahari Resources (Pty) Ltd and Kgalagadi Alloys (Pty) Ltd

661/2024 (GJ)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Unterhalter JA
Vally AJA

Tuesday: 04 March 2025

COURT A

32. Patricia Bridget Mason N O v Graham Andrew Mason and L Mason Electrical CC

1286/23 (ECP)

Zondi AP
Weiner JA
Keightley JA
Koen JA
Bloem AJA

COURT B

33. Van Schalkwyk Water CC t/a Oasis Water Kimberly and Albertus Barend Van Schalkwyk v Oasis Water (Pty) Ltd

988/2023 (NCK)

AND

Van Der Berg Water (Pty) Ltd t/a Oasis Water Lynwood, Chairmain Van Den Berg, Adriaan van den Berg; Deon Braam Van den Berg; Dewald Johannes Van Den Berg v Oasis Water (Pty) Ltd and Oasis Water Asset Company (Pty) Ltd

989/2023 (GP)

AND

Oasis Water (Pty) Ltd, Oasis Watrer Asset Company (Pty) Ltd v Wynand Albertus Bester and Janet Bester

1120/2023 (NWM)

Schippers JA

Nicholls JA
Meyer JA
Kgoele JA
Phatshoane AJA

COURT C

34. Western Cape Provincial Government, Acting Director: Supply Chain Management, Accounting Officer of The Department of Finance, Western Cape Provincial Government Head of Department of Community, Western Cape Provincial Government v D C Security (Pty) Ltd t/a D C Security and Eighteen Others (Second to Nineteenth Respondents)

971/2023 (WCC)

Mbatha JA
Baartman JA
Windell AJA
Modiba AJA
Norman AJA

Wednesday: 05 March 2025

COURT A

35. Marc Van Veen v Director of Public Prosecutions, Western Cape Minister of Justice and Correctional Services, The Financial Sector Conduct Authority

960/2023 & 104/204 (WCC)

Mokgohloa ADP
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Molitsokane AJA
Norman AJA

COURT B

36. Lend Mogapi v The Minister of Police

154/24 (NWM)

Mocumie JA
Schippers JA
Coppin JA
Musi AJA
Vally AJA

COURT C

37. Jonathan Reagan Schoeman v Director of Public Prosecutions Gauteng

972/2023 (GJ)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Unterhalter JA
Windell AJA

Thursday: 06 March 2025

COURT A**38. Thabo Joseph Sekabate v The State**

1223/23 (MP)

Zondi AP
Hughes JA
Keightley JA
Koen JA
Bloem AJA

COURT B**39. Quentin Arlow v The State.**

1124/23 (RC – MP)

Nicholls JA
Smith JA
Baartman JA
Modiba AJA
Molitswane AJA

COURT C**40. Papiki Sam Khumalo v The Minister of Police, Warrant Officer Motaung**

1163/2023 (FB)

Mbatha JA
Matojane JA
Kgoele JA
Coppin JA
Vally AJA

Friday: 07 March 2025

COURT A**41. Manyaba Rubben Mohlaloga v The State****1028/2023 And 1112/2023 (GP)**

Mokgohloa ADP
Weiner JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT B**42. The State v Mbana Peter Thabethe, Limakatso Moorosi, Seipati Silvia Dhlamini, Iqbal Meer Sharma, Nulane Investments 2024 (Pty) Ltd, Dinesh Patel, Island Site Investment One Hundred and Eighty (Pty) Ltd, Ronica Ragavan****839/2023 (FB)**

Schippers JA
Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Musi AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C**43. Director of Public Prosecutions: Gauteng Division v Thato Molefe, Zenzile Ndaba****417/24 (GP)**

Nicholls JA
Hughes JA
Baartman JA
Keightley JA
Windell AJA

Monday: 10 March 2025**COURT A****44. Maropene Frans Nakana v Johannes Claassens, Minister of Police, W/O Williams
Stationed at Westernburg Polokwane, Limpopo****137/24**

Mocumie JA
Kgoele JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA

Phatshoane AJA
Windell AJA

COURT B

45. Selona Ethypersadh v The Minister of Police N O, Sergeant Sydney Phahlane N O and The Acting Senior Magistrate Pretoria North T.V Thelede N O

1318/2023 (GP)

Mokgohloa ADP
Smith JA
Koen JA
Vally JA
Norman AJA

COURT C

46. Godfrey Alfred Ntuli v The State

20730/14 (GP)

Hughes JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA
Musi AJA
Bloem AJA

Tuesday: 11 March 2025

COURT A

47. Brenden Stephen Gilchrist v The State

643/23 (GP)

Zondi AP
Schippers JA
Hughes JA
Phatshoane AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

48. HOD: Western Cape Education Department, Director of the Metro East Education District and MEC for Education, Western Cape v Equal Education Law Centre, Neliswa Menizwa, Nwabisa Mpageva, Promise Mhluluwa, Somika Thengwa, Yolanda Toli and Mandisa Melani

1003/2023 (WCC)

Nicholls JA
Mbatha JA
Windell AJA
Bloem AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT C

49. The Lion Match Company (PTY) Limited v The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service

1047/2023 and 1067/2023 (GP)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Keightley JA
Norman AJA

Wednesday: 12 March 2025

COURT A

50. JT International Manufacturing South Africa (Pty) Ltd v The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service

1330/2023 (GP)

Zondi AP
Smith JA
Koen JA
Musi AJA
Phatshoane AJA

COURT B

51. Auckland Park Theological Seminary v Wamjay Holding Investments (Pty) Ltd

041/2024 (GJ)

Mocumie JA
Kgoele JA
Baartman JA
Bloem AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT C

52. Bidvest Protea Coin Security (Pty) Ltd v Mandla Wellem Mabena

986/2023 (MP)

Mokgohloa ADP
Mbatha JA
Weiner JA
Unterhalter JA
Modiba AJA

Thursday: 13 March 2025

COURT A

53. The Executive Council of the Province of KwaZulu Natal, The Premier of the Province of KwaZulu Natal and The Member of Executive Council for the Province of KwaZulu Natal Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs v Inkosi Bhekizizwenivard Luthuli, The Thulini Traditional Council, The Umndeni Wenkosi of Inkosi Luthuli, The Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, The National Department for Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, National House of Traditional Leaders, KwaZulu Natal Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs and The Section 23(4) Inquiry Presiding Officer: Mr Dube

1214/2023 (KZP)

Schippers JA
Kgoele JA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA
Norman AJA

COURT B

54. Kwadukuza Municipality v Consolidated Aone Trade and Invest 6 (Pty) Ltd [In Liquidation], Van Den Heever, Theodor Wilhelm N O, Nel, Eugene N O and Nkomo, Mduduzi Christopher N O

1273/2023 (KZD)

Mbatha JA
Hughes JA
Baartman JA
Vally AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT C

55. Jacob Pieters and Catharina Pieters v Stephan Corné Stemmett and Pieter Gabriël Stemmett

079/2024 (LCC)

Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Smith JA
Windell AJA

Friday: 14 March 2025

COURT A

56. Twenty Third Century Systems (Pty) Ltd v SAP Africa Region (Pty) Ltd

172/2023 (GJ)

Mocumie JA
Kgoele JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Windell AJA
Bloem AJA

COURT B

COURT C

Monday: 17 March 2025

COURT A.

57. Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality v Business Connexion (Pty) Ltd

1186/23 (GJ)

Nicholls JA
Keightley JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

COURT C

Tuesday: 18 March 2025

COURT A

58. Ocket Jacobus Steyn and Lieze Van Der Merwe v Wernich Venter, Hatzler & Steyn Beleggings CC and The Minister of Mineral and Energy Resources

096/2024 (NWM)

Zondi AP
Weiner JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Keightely JA
Coppin JA

COURT B

COURT C

Wednesday: 19 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C

Thursday: 20 March 2025

COURT A

59. The National Director of Public Prosecutions v Tariomix (Pty) Ltd, Louis Petrus Liebenberg and Magdalena Petronella Kleynhans

756/23 (GP)

Mbatha JA
Hughes JA
Meyer JA
Matojane JA
Koen JA

COURT B

COURT C

Friday: 21 March 2025

PUBLIC HOLIDAY – HUMAN RIGHTS DAY

Monday: 24 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C

Tuesday: 25 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C

Wednesday: 26 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C

Thursday: 27 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C

Friday: 28 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C

Monday: 31 March 2025

COURT A

COURT B

COURT C