

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF APPEAL OF  
SOUTH AFRICA**

**IN DIE HOOGSTE HOF VAN APPÈL VAN  
SUID-AFRIKA**



**FINAL ROLL**

**MAY 2025**

24 April 2025

The number of the Judge to whom in each case the judgment  
has been allocated is designated by dark shading

**Thursday: 01 May 2025**

**PUBLIC HOLIDAY**

**Friday: 02 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**1. Ramesa Johannes Rathebe v The State**

**1571/2024 (GP)**

Mocumie JA
Keightley JA
Baartman JA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

**COURT B**

**2. Matric Luphondo v The State**

**123/2024 (GP)**

Makgoka JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Coppin JA
Dawood AJA

**COURT C**

**3. Barend Hermanus Rautenbach, Johan Smit, Francois Smit, Barend De Klerk v The Governing Body of Die Hoërskool DF Malan, The Western Cape Minister of Education**

**073/2024 (WCC)**

Mokgohloa JA
Mbatha JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Modiba AJA

**COURT D**

**4. Cynthia Nobuhle Khedama v Minister of Police**

**667/2024 (KZP)**

Hughes JA
Dlodlo AJA
Steyn AJA

**Monday: 05 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**5. Pine Glow Investments (Pty) Ltd v The Minister of Energy, The Controller of Petroleum Products, ERF 6 Highveld Technopark Investments (Pty) Ltd, NAD Property Income Fund (Pty) Ltd, Royale Energy (Pty) Ltd, Royale Energy Management Service (Pty) Ltd, Royale Energy Olifantsfontein (Pty) Ltd, Viva Oil (Pty) Ltd, Tokivect (Pty) Ltd**  
1264/2023 (MP)

Zondi DP
MocumieJA
Mokgohloa JA
Koen JA
Molitsokane AJA

**COURT B**

**6. Tridevco (Pty) Ltd and Witfontein X16 Boedery CC v The National Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, Delegate of the Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, The Registrar of Deeds, Pretoria, The Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality**  
062/2024 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Unterhalter JA
Dawood AJA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT C**

**7. Jomane Eiendomme (Pty) Ltd v Magistrate E.M van Zyl and Jan Lodewyk Vosloo**  
067/2024 (NWM)

Mbatha JA
Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Coppin JA
Phatshoane AJA

**Tuesday: 06 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**8. Maria Johanna Kruger v Tate Matthew Sibanyoni & Sibanyoni Family, Minister of Rural Development & Land Reform, Provincial Head of the Department & Land Reform, Eskom Holdings (Pty) Ltd and Steve Tshwete Municipality**  
1191/2023 (LCC)

Mokgohloa JA
Smith JA
Tolmay AJA
Molitsokane AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT B**

**9. Godfrey Goliath Nicholls N O, Ilse Hope Solomon N O and Elana Oosthuizen N O v  
Magdalena Gaybba  
865/2023 (WCC)**

Hughes JA
Weiner JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Henney AJA
Modiba AJA

**COURT C**

**10. Mbalenhle Sydney Ntuli v The State  
128/2023 (GJ)**

Matojane JA
Unterhalter JA
Koen JA
Coppin JA
Dawood AJA

**Wednesday: 07 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**11. Kgosi Nyalala Molefe John Pilane, Bakgatla Ba Kgafela Traditional Council, Bakgatla  
ba Kgafela Royal Family (Moruleng) v Premier of the North West Province, Rangwane  
Ramono Pilane Linchwe, Kgafela Kgafela II, Phenias Tjie  
035/2024 (NWM)**

Molemela P
Mothle JA
Hughes JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Norman AJA

**COURT B**

**12. Casper Daniel Kasselmann NO, Gertruida Susanna Kasselmann NO, BVD  
Administration of States (Pty) Ltd and Loxodonta (Pty) Ltd v The South African National  
Road Agency SOC Ltd (SANRAL), The Minister, Department of Transport and The  
Minister, Department of Mineral Resources & Energy  
297/2024 (GP)**

Zondi JA
Nicholls JA
Coppin JA
Steyn AJA
Tolmay AJA

**COURT C**

**13. The Rock Foundation properties cc, Esther Nyarwai Ndegwa v Dosvelt Properties (Pty)  
Ltd and Eli Nathan Chaitowitz**

1038/2023 (GJ)

Mocumie JA
Keightley JA
Unterhalter JA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

**Thursday: 08 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**14. Engela Dorothea Maria Annandale v Meintjes and Meintjes Rekenmeesters CC, Old Mutual Trust (Pty) t/a Old Mutual Trust**

632/23 (GP)

Mocumie JA
Keightley JA
Phatshoane AJA

**COURT B**

**15. Martha Johanna Petronella Rossouw v Blignaut & Wessels, MEC: Police, Roads and Transport for the province of the Free State**

1234/23 (FB)

Makgoka JA
Mbatha JA
Weiner JA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA

**COURT C**

**Friday: 09 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**16. AV Theron & Swanepool Inc, Matthys Swanepoel v Neil Sean Knott**

237/2024 (FB)

Mocumie JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Smith JA
Dawood AJA
Henney AJA

**COURT B**

**17. Herman Mercer Crous v Wynberg Boys High School, Eastco Travel CC and Lorraine Fourie**

200/2024 (GP)

Makgoka JA
Weiner JA
Koen JA

Baartman JA
Tolmay AJA

**COURT C**

**18. Johannes Diederick Le Roux N O (Curator ad item for Ntomzodwa Patricia Olifant) and Johannes Diederick Le Roux N O (Curator ad item for Johannes Barry) v The Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality**  
**239/2024 (ECMK)**

Hughes JA
Matojane JA
Steyn AJA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA

**Monday: 12 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**19. Glencore Operations South Africa (Pty) Ltd; Arm Coal (Pty) Ltd and Goedgevonden Joint Venture v The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Services and Anand Khelawon N O**  
**406/24 (GP)**

Molemela P
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Phatshoane AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT B**

**20. Manyaku Maria Thulare v Morwamohube Ernest Thulare, Thoromet Jane Deborah Thulare, The Premier, Limpopo Province, The Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, The President of the Republic of South Africa and Limpopo House of Traditional Leaders**  
**470/2023 (LP)**

Zondi JA
Keightley JA
Unterhalter JA
Steyn AJA
Henney AJA

**COURT C**

**21. Aptitude Trading Enterprise (Pty) Ltd v The City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, The Municipal Manager of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality**  
**251/24 (GP)**

Mocumie JA
Mokgohloa JA
Coppin JA
Tolmay AJA

Molitswane AJA
----------------

**COURT D****22. Kobus Nel v The State****708/2023 (GP)**

Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

<b>Tuesday: 13 May 2025</b>
-----------------------------

**COURT A****23. Minister of Home Affairs, Director-General of the Department of Home Affairs v Vindiren Magadzire, Zimbabwe Immigration Federation NPC****245/2024 (GP)**

Mocumie JA
Mbatha JA
Unterhalter JA
Dawood AJA
Modiba AJA

**COURT B****24. Kurt Robert Knoop N O, Johan Louis Klopper N O v Islandsite Investments 180 (Pty) Ltd, Ronica Ragavan N O, Dhanesvarin Appavoo N O and Hugh Vincent Cooke****260/24 (FB)****with****Islandsite Investments 180 (Pty) Ltd, Ronica Ragavan N O v Kurt Robert Knoop N O, Johan Louis Klopper N O, Dinesh Appavoo N O and Hugh Vincent Cooke****746/2024 (FB)**

Makgoka JA
Mothle JA
Baartman JA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

**COURT C****25. Jansen Van Vuuren, Dillion Wesley v The Member of the Executive Council for Health, Gauteng Province****054/2024 (GP)**

Mokgohloa JA
Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA

**COURT D**

**26. Assmang (Pty) Ltd v The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service, The Minister of Justice, The Minister of Finance**

**311/2024 (GP)**

Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

**Wednesday: 14 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**27. James Thomas Evans v Western Province Athletics**

**1349/2024 (WCC)**

Mbatha JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Dawood AJA
Molitsokane AJA

**COURT B**

**28. Parch Properties 72 (Pty) Ltd v Summervale Lifestyle Estate Owner's Association, City of Cape Town, Theodore Brophy and Willem Hendrik Du Preez and 282 other Respondents)**

**171/24 (WCC)**

Mokgohloa JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA
Steyn AJA
Tolmay AJA

**COURT C**

**29. Francois Jurie Nicolaas (Cois) Harman v Pieter Hendrik Strydom**

**285/2024 (NWM)**

Mothle JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

**Thursday: 15 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**30. Kido Staalwerke CC v Safety Engineering International LLC, Aeroklas Duys (Pty) Ltd**

**265/1024 (GP)**



Molemela P
Mocumie JA
Makgoka JA
Unterhalter JA
Phatshoane AJA

**COURT B**

**31. The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service v African Bank Ltd**  
**242/24 (WCC)**

Zondi DP
Keightley JA
Dlodlo AJA
Steyn AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT C**

**32. Eugene Prinsloo v Donovan Theodore Majiedt N O and Reinette Steynburg N O**  
**257/2024 (FB)**

Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Koen JA
Henney AJA
Modiba JA

**Friday: 16 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**33. Tight Business Enterprises CC v Petrus Johannes Lordan N O, Theodorus Louis Lordan N O and Charles Jakobus Pieterse [Trustees of the Lordan Trust (IT 1795/19950)]**  
**356/2024 (GP)**

Mocumie JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Tolmay AJA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA

**COURT B**

**34. The Financial Sector Conduct Authority, Unathi Kamlana N O, Brandon Topham N O, Gerrit Jacques Bruwer N O v Municipal Employees' Pension Fund, Akani Retirement Fund Administrators (Pty) Ltd, Akani Properties (Pty) Ltd, Munghana Leisure And Tourism (Pty) Ltd, Margaret Magdalena Le Grange, Zamani Ernest Ephraim Letjane, Nthabeleng Refilwe Motsphi, Jack Bruce Malebane**  
**1344/2023 (GP)**

Makgoka JA
Nicholls JA
Smith JA
Dawood AJA
Molitsane AJA

**COURT C**

**35. City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, The Municipality Manager of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality v Lombardy Development (Pty) Ltd, Karin Geldenhuys, Johannes Frederic Geldenhuys, Cecilia Loots, Lisa Hopkinson, Lyn Cher Calle, Emily Mathilda Bezuidenhout, Nicolaas Wynand Bezuidenhout, Liza Hamman, Hugh Arundel Van Der Onselen, Johan Siebert Van Onselen, Marion Grassini, Carlos Arturo Grassini, Marcos Arturo Grassini**  
**078/2024 (GP)**

Mbatha JA
Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA

**Monday: 19 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**36. Melusi Emmanuel Ncala v Park Avenue Body Corporate, Community Scheme Ombud Services and Dombolo Magkomo Masilela N O**  
**813/2023 (GP)**

Makgoka JA
Mbatha JA
Keightley JA
Tolmay AJA
Vally AJA

**COURT B**

**37. The Sheriff of the High Court: Giyani (Sidney Herbert Park, an officer of the Court) v Renky Thulani Makhubela**  
**1270/2023 (LP)**

Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT C**

**38. Kurt Robert Knoop, Johan Louis Klopper, Juanito Martin Damons, Kgashane Christopher Monyela v Tegeta Exploration and Resources (Pty) Ltd, Koornfontein Mines (Pty) Ltd, Optimum Coal Mine (Pty) Ltd, Ronica Ragavan, Dhanasegaran Archary**  
**312/2024 (GP)**

Hughes JA
Weiner JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Molitsokane AJA

**Tuesday: 20 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**39. The Kingdom of Lesotho v Frazer Solar GMBH, Trans-Caledon Tunnel Authority, Lesotho Highland Development Authority, The Standard Bank of South Africa Limited, The Sherriff of the High Court: Johannesburg Central, The Sheriff of the High Court: Centurion East, The Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development, National Government of the Republic of South Africa**  
**438/2024 (GJ)**

Molemela P
Makgoka JA
Mokgohloa JA
Smith JA
Koen JA
Steyn AJA
Modiba AJA

**COURT B**

**40. Intengo Imoto (Pty) Ltd t/a Northcliff Nissan v Zoutpansberg Motor Wholesalers CC t/a Hyundai Louis Trichardt**  
**474/2024 (LP)**

Zondi DP
Mothle JA
Weiner JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Coppin JA

**COURT C**

**41. Minister of Police and National Director of Public Prosecutions v Khotso Julius Ramabanta**  
**511/24 (FB)**

Mbatha JA
Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

**COURT D**

**42. Maano Water (Pty) Ltd v Eskom Holdings SOC Ltd**  
**383/2024 (GJ)**

Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Phatshoane AJA

**Wednesday: 21 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**43. Inzalo Enterprise Management Systems (Pty) Ltd v Chief Albert Luthuli Municipality**  
102/2024 (MP)

Nicholls JA
Unterhalter JA
Norman AJA

**COURT B**

**44. The MEC for Health: Gauteng Province, Head of Department of Health for the Gauteng Province, Chairperson of the Bid Adjudication Committee, Chairperson of the Bid Evaluation Committee and Tshenolo Waste (Pty) Ltd v Buhle Waste (Pty) Ltd**  
338/2024 & 384/2024 (GJ)

Mbatha JA
Baartman JA
Steyn AJA
Tolmay AJA
Vally AJA

**COURT C**

**45. Maximum Profit Recovery (Pty) Ltd v Naledi Local Municipality, Tripple M Advisory Services (Pty) Ltd and Segapo Modisenya**  
340/2024 (NWM)

Hughes JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Smith JA
Keightley JA
Henney AJA

**Thursday: 22 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**46. Julie Lopes, Democratic Alliance v Executive Mayor of the Knysna Local Municipality, Aubrey Tsengwa, Deputy Executive Mayor of the Knysna Local Municipality, Alberto Marbi and Speaker of the Knysna Local Municipality.**  
345/2024 (WCC)

Makgoka JA
Mokgohloa JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Dawood AJA
Modiba AJA

**COURT B**

**47. Pick n Pay Retailers (Pty) Ltd v Shoprite Checkers (Pty) Ltd**  
363/2024 (WCC)

Nicholls JA
Mothle JA

Coppin JA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT C**

**48. N'wamitwa Solomon Mkhonto, Walter Daniele Mokoena, Zulu Willias Seerane, Tsundzuka Remember Makhubela, Ephraim Nkuna, N'wanungu Sipho Mlambo, Lakios Mosoma, Fhumulani Cathrine Thovhakale, Ngungunyane Henry Mhlaba v Bushbuckbridge Local Municipality, Cynthia Audrey Nkuna: Municipal Manager, Sylvia Khumalo: Executive Mayor**

**218/24 (MP)**

Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Koen JA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

**Friday: 23 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**49. Hassody Katha v Primathie Pillay N O, Kenderuby Ramoothy N O, Master of the High Court: Gauteng Johannesburg**

**276/2024 (GJ)**

Matojane JA
Koen JA
Dlodlo AJA
Dawood AJA
Steyn AJA

**COURT B**

**50. King Sabata Dalinyebo Local Municipality, The Municipal Manager: King Sabata Dalinyebo Local Municipality , The Chief Financial Officer: King Sabata Dalindyebo Local Municipality v Fikile Vincent Hintsa and the Persons listed in Annexure “A”**

**323/2024 (ECM)**

Mokgohloa JA
Smith JA
Henney AJA
Modiba AJA
Molitsokane AJA

**COURT C**

**51. Tekoa Consulting Engineers (Pty) Ltd v Alfred Nzo District Municipality, Municipal Manager: Alfred Nzo District Municipality, Zinzame Consulting Engineers / Cycle Projects/ Ubuntu Bam JV, Emlanjeni JV, Olon Consulting Engineers JV Imp Plant Hire and BM Infrastructure JV Magnacorp**

**1094/2023 (ECG)**

Hughes JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA
Tolmay AJA

**Monday: 26 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**52. The Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v Trevor Allan John Malone, The Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development of the Republic of South Africa**

**428/2024 (KZD)**

Mocumie JA
Mbatha JA
Weiner JA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

**COURT B**

**53. The National Director of Public Prosecutions v Sithembiso Adolphus Gcaba**

**488/2024 (KZD)**

Makgoka JA
Coppin JA
Dawood AJA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

**COURT C**

**54. Hugo Ras v The State**

**885/2024 (GP)**

**with**

**Willem Andries Van Jaarsveld v The State**

**1105/2023 (GP)**

Matojane JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Tolmay AJA
Molitswane AJA

**Tuesday: 27 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**55. Dr Waa Gouws (Johannesburg) (Pty) Ltd v HR Computek (Pty) Ltd, Yolandi Ann Mes, Johannes Hendrick Du Plessis N O, Marial Oelofsen N O, Welcome Norman N O and Master of the High Court, Johannesburg  
909/2023 (GP)**

Mbatha JA
Mothle JA
Hughes JA
Unterhalter JA
Modiba AJA

**COURT B**

**Wednesday: 28 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**56(a). The President of the Republic of South Africa, The Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs v Prince Mbonisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Vulindlela Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Mathuba Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Gaylord Mxolisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Zweliyazuza Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Prince Bukhosikabupheli Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Prince Bhekinkosi Ernest Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembokuhle Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Silungile Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Gugulethu Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Zanele Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembelihle Cynthia Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Nokwethemba Bhekinkosi Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Sihlobosenkosi Linduzalo Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Phumuzuzulu Mzomuhle Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Thandeka Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khonzinkosi Sbambisile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Nhlanganiso Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Bazabazi Mbuzeli Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Sibusile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khethokuhle Zulu**

**147/2024 and 148/2024 and 217/2024 and 250/2024 (GP)**

Zondi DP
Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitssoane AJA

**Thursday: 29 May 2025**

**COURT A**

**56(b). The President of the Republic of South Africa, The Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs v Prince Mbonisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Vulindlela**

**Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Mathuba Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Gaylord Mxolisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Zweliyazuza Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Prince Bukhosikabupheli Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Prince Bhekinkosi Ernest Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembokuhle Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Silungile Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Gugulethu Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Zanele Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembelihle Cynthia Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Nokwethemba Bhekinkosi Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Sihlobosenkosi Linduzalo Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Phumuzuzulu Mzomuhle Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Thandeka Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khonzinkosi Sbambisile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Nhlanganiso Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Bazabazi Mbuzeli Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Sibusile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khethokuhle Zulu**

**147/2024 and 148/2024 and 217/2024 and 250/2024 (GP)**

Zondi DP
Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

**Friday: 30 May 2025**