

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF APPEAL OF
SOUTH AFRICA**

**IN DIE HOOGSTE HOF VAN APPÈL VAN
SUID-AFRIKA**



FINAL ROLL

MAY 2025

08 April 2025

The number of the Judge to whom in each case the judgment
has been allocated is designated by dark shading

Thursday: 01 May 2025

PUBLIC HOLIDAY

Friday: 02 May 2025

COURT A

1. Ramesa Johannes Rathebe v The State

1571/2024 (GP)

Mocumie JA
Keightley JA
Baartman JA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

COURT B

2. Matric Lumphondo v The State

123/2024 (GP)

Makgoka JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Coppin JA
Dawood AJA

COURT C

3. Barend Hermanus Rautenbach, Johan Smit, Francois Smit, Barend De Klerk v The Governing Body of Die Hoërskool DF Malan, The Western Cape Minister of Education

073/2024 (WCC)

Mokgohloa JA
Mbatha JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Modiba AJA

COURT D

4. Cynthia Nobuhle Khedama v Minister of Police

667/2024 (KZP)

Hughes JA
Dlodlo AJA
Steyn AJA

Monday: 05 May 2025

COURT A

5. Pine Glow Investments (Pty) Ltd v The Minister of Energy, The Controller of Petroleum Products, ERF 6 Highveld Technopark Investments (Pty) Ltd, NAD Property Income Fund (Pty) Ltd, Royale Energy (Pty) Ltd, Royale Energy Management Service (Pty) Ltd, Royale Energy Olifantsfontein (Pty) Ltd, Viva Oil (Pty) Ltd, Tokivect (Pty) Ltd
1264/2023 (MP)

Zondi DP
MocumieJA
Mokgohloa JA
Koen JA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT B

6. Tridevco (Pty) Ltd and Witfontein X16 Boedery CC v The National Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, Delegate of the Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, The Registrar of Deeds, Pretoria, The Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality
062/2024 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Unterhalter JA
Dawood AJA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C

7. Jomane Eiendomme (Pty) Ltd v Magistrate E.M van Zyl and Jan Lodewyk Vosloo
067/2024 (NWM)

Mbatha JA
Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Coppin JA
Phatshoane AJA

Tuesday: 06 May 2025

COURT A

8. Maria Johanna Kruger v Tate Matthew Sibanyoni & Sibanyoni Family, Minister of Rural Development & Land Reform, Provincial Head of the Department & Land Reform, Eskom Holdings (Pty) Ltd and Steve Tshwete Municipality
1191/2023 (LCC)

Mokgohloa JA
Smith JA
Tolmay AJA
Molitsokane AJA
Norman AJA

COURT B

**9. Godfrey Goliath Nicholls N O, Ilse Hope Solomon N O and Elana Oosthuizen N O v
Magdalena Gaybba
865/2023 (WCC)**

Hughes JA
Weiner JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Henney AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT C

**10. Mbalenhle Sydney Ntuli v The State
128/2023 (GJ)**

Matojane JA
Unterhalter JA
Koen JA
Coppin JA
Dawood AJA

Wednesday: 07 May 2025

COURT A

**11. Kgosi Nyalala Molefe John Pilane, Bakgatla Ba Kgafela Traditional Council, Bakgatla
ba Kgafela Royal Family (Moruleng) v Premier of the North West Province, Rangwane
Ramono Pilane Linchwe, Kgafela Kgafela II, Phenias Tjie
035/2024 (NWM)**

Molemela P
Mothle JA
Hughes JA
Kathree- Setiloane JA
Norman AJA

COURT B

**12. Casper Daniel Kasselmann NO, Gertruida Susanna Kasselmann NO, BVD
Administration of States (Pty) Ltd and Loxodonta (Pty) Ltd v The South African National
Road Agency SOC Ltd (SANRAL), The Minister, Department of Transport and The
Minister, Department of Mineral Resources & Energy
297/2024 (GP)**

Zondi DP
Nicholls JA
Coppin JA
Steyn AJA
Tolmay AJA

COURT C

**13. The Rock Foundation properties cc, Esther Nyarwai Ndegwa v Dosvelt Properties (Pty)
Ltd and Eli Nathan Chaitowitz**

1038/2023 (GJ)

Mocumie JA
Keightley JA
Unterhalter JA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

Thursday: 08 May 2025

COURT A

14. Engela Dorothea Maria Annandale v Meintjes and Meintjes Rekenmeesters CC, Old Mutual Trust (Pty) t/a Old Mutual Trust

632/23 (GP)

Mocumie JA
Nicholls JA
Keightley JA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT B

15. Martha Johanna Petronella Rossouw v Blignaut & Wessels, MEC: Police, Roads and Transport for the province of the Free State

1234/23 (FB)

Makgoka JA
Mbatha JA
Weiner JA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT C

16. Blair Atholl Home Owners' Association NPC v Stephen Leggatt and Margaret Elizabeth Taylor

259/24 (GJ)

Mokgohloa JA
Mothle JA
Smith JA
Baartman JA
Steyn AJA

Friday: 09 May 2025

COURT A

17. AV Theron & Swanepool Inc, Matthys Swanepoel v Neil Sean Knott

237/2024 (FB)

Mocumie JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Smith JA
Dawood AJA
Henney AJA

COURT B

18. Herman Mercer Crous v Wynberg Boys High School, Eastco Travel CC and Lorraine Fourie

200/2024 (GP)

Makgoka JA
Weiner JA
Koen JA
Baartman JA
Tolmay AJA

COURT C

19. Johannes Diederick Le Roux N O (Curator ad item for Ntomzodwa Patricia Olifant) and Johannes Diederick Le Roux N O (Curator ad item for Johannes Barry) v The Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality

239/2024 (ECMK)

Hughes JA
Matojane JA
Steyn AJA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA

Monday: 12 May 2025

COURT A

20. Glencore Operations South Africa (Pty) Ltd; Arm Coal (Pty) Ltd and Goedgevonden Joint Venture v The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Services and Anand Khelawon N O

406/24 (GP)

Molemela P
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Phatshoane AJA
Norman AJA

COURT B

21. Manyaku Maria Thulare v Morwamohube Ernest Thulare, Thoromet Jane Deborah Thulare, The Premier, Limpopo Province, The Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, The President of the Republic of South Africa and Limpopo House of Traditional Leaders

470/2023 (LP)

Zondi DP
Keightley JA
Unterhalter JA
Steyn AJA
Henney AJA

COURT C

**22. Aptitude Trading Enterprise (Pty) Ltd v The City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, The Municipal Manager of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality
251/24 (GP)**

Mocumie JA
Mokgohloa JA
Coppin JA
Tolmay AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT D

**23. Kobus Nel v The State
708/2023 (GP)**

Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

Tuesday: 13 May 2025

COURT A

**24. Minister of Home Affairs, Director-General of the Department of Home Affairs v
Vindiren Magadzire, Zimbabwe Immigration Federation NPC
245/2024 (GP)**

Mocumie JA
Mbatha JA
Unterhalter JA
Dawood AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

**25. Kurt Robert Knoop N O, Johan Louis Klopper N O v Islandsite Investments 180 (Pty)
Ltd, Ronica Ragavan N O, Dhanesvarin Appavoo N O and Hugh Vincent Cooke
260/24 (FB)**

with

**Islandsite Investments 180 (Pty) Ltd, Ronica Ragavan N O v Kurt Robert Knoop N O,
Johan Louis Klopper N O, Dinesh Appavoo N O and Hugh Vincent Cooke
746/2024 (FB)**

Makgoka JA
Mothle JA
Baartman JA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

COURT C

26. Jansen Van Vuuren, Dillion Wesley v The Member of the Executive Council for Health, Gauteng Province
054/2024 (GP)

Mokgohloa JA
Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA

COURT D

27. Assmang (Pty) Ltd v The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service, The Minister of Justice, The Minister of Finance
311/2024 (GP)

Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

Wednesday: 14 May 2025

COURT A

28. James Thomas Evans v Western Province Athletics
1349/2024 (WCC)

Mbatha JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Koen JA
Dawood AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT B

29. Parch Properties 72 (Pty) Ltd v Summervale Lifestyle Estate Owner's Association, City of Cape Town, Theodore Brophy and Willem Hendrik Du Preez and 282 other Respondents)
171/24 (WCC)

Mokgohloa JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA
Steyn AJA
Tolmay AJA

COURT C

30. Francois Jurie Nicolaas (Cois) Harman v Pieter Hendrik Strydom
285/2024 (NWM)

Mothle JA
Weiner JA
Smith JA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

Thursday: 15 May 2025

COURT A

31. Kido Staalwerke CC v Safety Engineering International LLC, Aeroklas Duys (Pty) Ltd
265/1024 (GP)

Molemela P
Mocumie JA
Makgoka JA
Unterhalter JA
Phatshoane AJA

COURT B

32. The Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service v African Bank Ltd
242/24 (WCC)

Zondi DP
Keightley JA
Dlodlo AJA
Steyn AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C

33. Eugene Prinsloo v Donovan Theodore Majiedt N O and Reinette Steynburg N O
257/2024 (FB)

Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Koen JA
Henney AJA
Modiba JA

Friday: 16 May 2025

COURT A

34. Tight Business Enterprises CC v Petrus Johannes Lordan N O, Theodorus Louis Lordan N O and Charles Jakobus Pieterse [Trustees of the Lordan Trust (IT 1795/19950)]
356/2024 (GP)

Mocumie JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Tolmay AJA
Vally AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

35. The Financial Sector Conduct Authority, Unathi Kamlana N O, Brandon Topham N O, Gerrit Jacques Bruwer N O v Municipal Employees' Pension Fund, Akani Retirement Fund Administrators (Pty) Ltd, Akani Properties (Pty) Ltd, Munghana Leisure And Tourism (Pty) Ltd, Margaret Magdalena Le Grange, Zamani Ernest Ephraim Letjane, Nthabeleng Refilwe Motsahi, Jack Bruce Malebane
1344/2023 (GP)

Makgoka JA
Nicholls JA
Smith JA
Dawood AJA
Molitssoane AJA

COURT C

36. City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, The Municipality Manager of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality v Lombardy Development (Pty) Ltd, Karin Geldenhuys, Johannes Frederic Geldenhuys, Cecilia Loots, Lisa Hopkinson, Lyn Cher Calle, Emily Mathilda Bezuidenhout, Nicolaas Wynand Bezuidenhout, Liza Hamman, Hugh Arundel Van Der Onselen, Johan Siebert Van Onselen, Marion Grassini, Carlos Arturo Grassini, Marcos Arturo Grassini
078/2024 (GP)

Mbatha JA
Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA

Monday: 19 May 2025

COURT A

37. Melusi Emmanuel Ncala v Park Avenue Body Corporate, Community Scheme Ombud Services and Dombolo Magkomo Masilela N O
813/2023 (GP)

Makgoka JA
Mbatha JA
Keightley JA
Tolmay AJA
Vally AJA

COURT B

38. The Sheriff of the High Court: Giyani (Sidney Herbert Park, an officer of the Court) v Renky Thulani Makhubela
1270/2023 (LP)

Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C

**39. Kurt Robert Knoop, Johan Louis Klopper, Juanito Martin Damons, Kgashane Christopher Monyela v Tegeta Exploration and Resources (Pty) Ltd, Koornfontein Mines (Pty) Ltd, Optimum Coal Mine (Pty) Ltd, Ronica Ragavan, Dhanasegaran Archary
312/2024 (GP)**

Hughes JA
Weiner JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Molitsokane AJA

Tuesday: 20 May 2025

COURT A

**40. The Kingdom of Lesotho v Frazer Solar GMBH, Trans-Caledon Tunnel Authority, Lesotho Highland Development Authority, The Standard Bank of South Africa Limited, The Sherriff of the High Court: Johannesburg Central, The Sheriff of the High Court: Centurion East, The Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development, National Government of the Republic of South Africa
438/2024 (GJ)**

Molemela P
Makgoka JA
Mokgohloa JA
Smith JA
Koen JA
Steyn AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

**41. Intengo Imoto (Pty) Ltd t/a Northcliff Nissan v Zoutpansberg Motor Wholesalers CC
t/a Hyundai Louis Trichardt
474/2024 (LP)**

Zondi DP
Mothle JA
Weiner JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Coppin JA

COURT C

**42. Minister of Police and National Director of Public Prosecutions v Khotso Julius Ramabanta
511/24 (FB)**

Mbatha JA

Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

COURT D**43. Maano Water (Pty) Ltd v Eskom Holdings SOC Ltd****383/2024 (GJ)**

Matojane JA
Keightley JA
Phatshoane AJA

Wednesday: 21 May 2025**COURT A****44. Inzalo Enterprise Management Systems (Pty) Ltd v Chief Albert Luthuli****Municipality****102/2024 (MP)**

Nicholls JA
Unterhalter JA
Norman AJA

COURT B**45. The MEC for Health: Gauteng Province, Head of Department of Health for the Gauteng Province, Chairperson of the Bid Adjudication Committee, Chairperson of the Bid Evaluation Committee and Tshenolo Waste (Pty) Ltd v Buhle Waste (Pty) Ltd****338/2024 & 384/2024 (GJ)**

Mbatha JA
Baartman JA
Steyn AJA
Tolmay AJA
Vally AJA

COURT C**46. Maximum Profit Recovery (Pty) Ltd v Naledi Local Municipality, Tripple M Advisory Services (Pty) Ltd and Segapo Modisenya****340/2024 (NWM)**

Hughes JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Smith JA
Keightley JA
Henney AJA

Thursday: 22 May 2025**COURT A**

47. Julie Lopes, Democratic Alliance v Executive Mayor of the Knysna Local Municipality, Aubrey Tsengwa, Deputy Executive Mayor of the Knysna Local Municipality, Alberto Marbi and Speaker of the Knysna Local Municipality.

345/2024 (WCC)

Makgoka JA
Mokgohloa JA
Kathree-Setiloane JA
Dawood AJA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

48. Pick n Pay Retailers (Pty) Ltd v Shoprite Checkers (Pty) Ltd

363/2024 (WCC)

Nicholls JA
Mothle JA
Coppin JA
Vally AJA
Norman AJA

COURT C

49. N'wamitwa Solomon Mkhonto, Walter Daniele Mokoena, Zulu Willias Seerane, Tsundzuka Remember Makhubela, Ephraim Nkuna, N'wanungu Siphon Mlambo, Lakios Mosoma, Fhumulani Cathrine Thovhakale, Ngungunyane Henry Mhlaba v Bushbuckbridge Local Municipality, Cynthia Audrey Nkuna: Municipal Manager, Sylvia Khumalo: Executive Mayor

218/24 (MP)

Matojane JA
Weiner JA
Koen JA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitssoane AJA

Friday: 23 May 2025

COURT A

50. Hassody Katha v Primathie Pillay N O, Kenderuby Ramoosy N O, Master of the High Court: Gauteng Johannesburg

276/2024 (GJ)

Matojane JA
Koen JA
Dlodlo AJA
Dawood AJA
Steyn AJA

COURT B

51. King Sabata Dalinyebo Local Municipality, The Municipal Manager: King Sabata Dalinyebo Local Municipality , The Chief Financial Officer: King Sabata Dalindyebo Local Municipality v Fikile Vincent Hintsu and the Persons listed in Annexure “A”
323/2024 (ECM)

Mokgohloa JA
Smith JA
Henney AJA
Modiba AJA
Molitsokane AJA

COURT C

52. Tekoa Consulting Engineers (Pty) Ltd v Alfred Nzo District Municipality, Municipal Manager: Alfred Nzo District Municipality, Zinzame Consulting Engineers / Cycle Projects/ Ubuntu Bam JV, Emlanjeni JV, Olon Consulting Engineers JV Imp Plant Hire and BM Infrastructure JV Magnacorp
1094/2023 (ECG)

Hughes JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Coppin JA
Tolmay AJA

Monday: 26 May 2025

COURT A

53. The Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v Trevor Allan John Malone, The Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development of the Republic of South Africa
428/2024 (KZD)

Mocumie JA
Weiner JA
Vally AJA
Molitsokane AJA
Norman AJA

COURT B

54. The National Director of Public Prosecutions v Sithembiso Adolphus Gcaba
488/2024 (KZD)

Makgoka JA
Coppin JA
Dawood AJA
Phatshoane AJA
Henney AJA

COURT C

55. Hugo Ras v The State
885/2024 (GP)

with

Willem Andries Van Jaarsveld v The State

1105/2023 (GP)

Mbatha JA
Matojane JA
Unterhalter JA
Baartman JA
Tolmay AJA

Tuesday: 27 May 2025

COURT A

56. Dr Waa Gouws (Johannesburg) (Pty) Ltd v HR Computek (Pty) Ltd, Yolandi Ann Mes, Johannes Hendrick Du Plessis N O, Marial Oelofsen N O, Welcome Norman N O and Master of the High Court, Johannesburg

909/2023 (GP)

Mbatha JA
Mothle JA
Hughes JA
Unterhalter JA
Modiba AJA

COURT B

57. Equal Education v MEC for Education, Western Cape Government, Premier of the Western Cape, Minister of Basic Education, Minister of Justice and Correctional Services
298/20241 (WCC)

AND

58. South African Democratic Teachers' Union v MEC for Education, Western Cape, National Minister of Basic Education, Speaker of the Provincial Legislature, Western Cape Province, The Premier of the Western Cape, Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development

351/2024 (WCC)

Matojane JA
Saldulker AJA
Dlodlo AJA

Wednesday: 28 May 2025

COURT A

59(a). The President of the Republic of South Africa, The Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs v Prince Mbonisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Vulindlela Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Mathuba Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Gaylord Mxolisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Zweliyazuza Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Prince Bukhosikabupheli Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Prince Bhekinkosi Ernest Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembokuhle Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Silungile Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Gugulethu Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Zanele Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembelihle Cynthia Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Nokwethemba Bhekinkosi Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Sihlobosenkosi Linduzalo Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Phumuzuzulu Mzomuhle Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Thandeka Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khonzinkosi Sbambisile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Nhlanganiso Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Bazabazi Mbuzeli Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Sibusile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khethokuhle Zulu

147/2024 and 148/2024 and 217/2024 and 250/2024 (GP)

Zondi DP
Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Phatshoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

Thursday: 29 May 2025

COURT A

59(b). The President of the Republic of South Africa, The Minister of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs v Prince Mbonisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Vulindlela Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Mathuba Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Gaylord Mxolisi Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Zweliyazuza Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Prince Bukhosikabupheli Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Prince Bhekinkosi Ernest Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembokuhle Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Silungile Ka Bhekuzulu, Princess Gugulethu Ka Ngqinda Ka Solomon, Princess Zanele Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Thembelihle Cynthia Ka Ningi Ka Solomon, Princess Lindiwe Ka Bhekuzulu, Prince Nokwethemba Bhekinkosi Ka Nkunziyezambane Ka Solomon, Princess Sihlobosenkosi Linduzalo Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Phumuzuzulu Mzomuhle Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Thandeka Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Khonzinkosi Sbambisile Ka Zwelithini Zulu, Prince Nhlanganiso Ka Zwelithini

**Zulu, Prince Bazabazi Mbuzeli Zwelithini Zulu, Princess Sibusile Ka Zwelithini Zulu,
Princess Khethokuhle Zulu**

147/2024 and 148/2024 and 217/2024 and 250/2024 (GP)

Zondi DP
Nicholls JA
Saldulker AJA
Phatsoane AJA
Molitsokane AJA

Friday: 30 May 2025